Mr. Javed Ahmad Ghamidi vs. Ali Sina Part 6

Javed Ahmad Ghamidi vs. Ali Sina

A Beast as the Messenger of Allah

Question asked from Mr. Ghamidi by Ali Sina

When Muhammad claimed to be a prophet, people who knew him best, laughed at him. They asked for proof. He had none. Then they asked why God does not send an angel so they could be sure? Muhammad's response to them was that God sends human prophets to human beings.

People said:

> You are no more than human beings like us! You wish to turn us away from what our fathers used to worship. Then bring us a clear authority. (14:10)

This is logical. If Muhammad did not present any proof, how could people know he is telling them the truth? (see also 23:47)

Allah responded by asking:

> Is it a wonder for mankind that We have inspired a man among them? (10:2)

He further complained:

> That was because there came to them their Messengers with clear proofs, but they said: "Shall mere men guide us" (64:6)

Well, I would like to see that clear proof. If we had that clear proof, we would not be having this discussion. Then Allah gives his reasons why the messengers to humans are always other humans and not angels or something else.

> And naught prevented mankind from believing when the guidance came unto them save that they said: Hath Allah sent a mortal as (His) messenger? Say: If there were in the earth angels walking secure, We had sent down for them from heaven an angel as messenger. (17:94-95)
>
> We never sent before thee any messengers but lo! they verily ate food and walked in the markets. And those who look not for a meeting with Us say: Why are angels not sent down unto us and (Why) do we not see our Lord! Assuredly they think too highly of themselves and are scornful with great pride (25:20- 21)
>
> And We have not sent before you but men from (among) the people of the towns, to whom We sent revelations. (12: 109)

> And We sent not (as Our messengers) before thee other than men, whom We inspired. We gave them not bodies that would not eat food, nor were they immortals. (21:7-8)

Ibn Kathir in the tafseer of Sura Isra explains:

And there are many other similar Ayat. Then Allah says, pointing out His kindness and mercy towards His servants, that He sends to them Messengers of their own kind so that they will understand what he says and will be able to speak to him directly. If He sent to mankind a Messenger from among the angels, they would not be able to deal with him face to face and learn from him, as Allah says: “Indeed, Allah conferred a great favor on the believers when He sent among them a Messenger from among themselves” (3:164)

Ibn Kathir is right; there are other verses. What I quoted so far is enough to make us understand that for men, only men will be sent as messengers and not something else. But we find that Allah contradicts himself.

> And when the word is fulfilled concerning them, **We shall bring forth a beast of the earth to speak unto them** because mankind had not faith in Our revelations. (27:82)

Here Allah is promising that he will send **a beast** to bring his message to mankind. Doesn’t this belie everything he has said in all those above-mentioned verses? Do beasts of the earth speak Arabic better than angels? What kind of beast will be this messenger of Allah? Will it be a jackass, a camel, a crocodile or a chimpanzee? How would we recognize it? According to Islam, Jinns also can appear in animals. Why animals can speak to humans and angels can’t?

Then again didn’t Muhammad claim to be the last prophet? (33:40) If he was the last one to bring us a message from God, then what is this beast going to be? If this beast is going to bring us a message, he is a messenger and the title of *Khatama alnnabiyyeen* (the last of prophets) that Muhammad claimed for himself should go to this animal. If 33:40 is right then the verse 27:82 must be wrong.

Furthermore, it is not true that angles do not bring messages from God to humans. The Quran itself testifies that at the time of Solomon there were two angels in Babel, Harut and Marut who spoke to people and said “We are only a temptation, therefore disbelieve not (in the guidance of Allah).” Then the Quran says:

> And from these two (angles) people learn that by which they cause division between man and wife; but they injure thereby no-one save by Allah's leave. And they learn that which harmeth them and profiteth them not. (2:102)

Also the Quran says an angel appeared to Zechariah the father of John (Yahya) and brought him the glad tiding that he is going to have a son:

> Then the angels called to him as he stood praying in the sanctuary: That Allah gives you the good news of Yahya verifying a Word from Allah, and honorable and chaste and a prophet from among the good ones. (3:39)

Don't these two verses contradict the previous *ayat* that deny the possibility of angels coming to humans as messengers?

A little further down (3:42, 45) again it is an angel who brings a message to Mary the mother of Jesus, informing her that she is going to have a son. In another part of the Quran, the same angel is appearing to Mary says:

> I am only a messenger of your Lord: That I will give you a pure boy. (19:19)

Either, angels can be messages of God to humans or they can't. In either case some of the verses of the Quran must be false.

The difficulty does not end here. The above verses are emphatic that the messengers that Allah sends to each species will be of the same species. However, the Quran says that Muhammad was sent as a messenger also to the Jinns.

> And when We turned towards you a party of the jinn who listened to the Quran; so when they came to it, they said: Be silent; then when it was finished, they turned back to their people warning (them). (46-29)

Then the Jinns said to each other:

> And whoever does not accept the-Divine caller, he shall not escape in the earth and he shall not have guardians besides Him, these are in manifest error. (46:32)

The same claim is made in Sura Jinn (72: 1-14)

There are also many ahadith that talk about Muhammad going to the Jinns and teaching them Islam. For brevity I pass them up.

How could Muhammad who was a man, at least according to his own claim, become a messenger to the Jinns when in so many verses he said to each species will be sent a messenger of their own kind?

The Quran claims that both Jinns and men have received messengers from among them.

> O assembly of jinn and men! did there not come to you messengers from among you, relating to you My communications and warning you of the meeting of this day of yours? (6:130)

According to the Quran also angels have their own messengers:

> Allah chooses messengers from angels and from men, for Allah is He Who hears and sees (all things).(22:75)
>
> All praise is due to Allah, the Originator of the heavens and the earth, the Maker of the angels, **apostles flying on wings**, two, and three, and four; He increases in creation what He pleases; surely Allah has power over all things.(35:1)

So how is it that Muhammad goes to the Jinns and becomes their messenger if he is not of their kind? And how come to us humans a beast will be sent to deliver the message of Allah?

I remain sincerely yours

Ali Sina

Note: I would like to make this very clear, that although Mr. Ghamidi, Mr. Zaheer and this author have diverging viewpoints as far as Islam is concerned, I am strongly supportive of these two scholars and have utmost respect for their great work. Muslim world needs men like them. I appreciate what they do and wish them success. They try to humanize the Umma at the risk to their own lives. It is regrettable that Mr. Ghamidi must be protected by bodyguards to stay safe from the assault of Muslim fanatics.

As our slogan says, we are not against faith but against hate. Anyone who strives for peace and fights against intolerance and hate is our friend and ally. We do not want to see the end of religion. We want to see the end of religiously inspired hate. I believe that Mr. Ghamidi and Mr. Zaheer have embarked on an impossible mission. I applaud them but do not believe they will make it.

Upon informing Mr. Zaheer that I have published my response, he wrote:

Dear Mr Ali Sina

I am finding it difficult to access your site. Can I get your response directly? Thanks.

Khalid Zaheer

This is regrettable. It seems that they have proceeded to ban faithfreedom.org in Pakistan. Several Islamic countries have banned us. For 1400 years Muslim leaders have kept the masses ignorant. In this way they can rule them better. But for how long they can keep people in the dark?